School of the Arts Promotion and Tenure Review

Advice for PEER REVIEW COMMITTEES

This document is prepared by the School of the Arts Promotion and Tenure Committee and is designed to assist peer review committees in the collection, preparation and review of all documents required to complete their part of the promotion, or promotion and tenure review process in the School of the Arts. This document supplements the appropriate Faculty Promotion and Tenure Policies and Procedures document for the candidate's department, the School of the Arts and the University.

Contents

A. Checklist for Peer Review Committee

The Peer Review Committee (PRC) should:

1.____ Maintain complete confidentiality concerning committee business.

2.____ Elect a secretary. The secretary will keep minutes of committee meetings.

3.____ Develop its list of 4 or 5 potential external evaluators. Receive the candidate's list of potential external evaluators. Develop a final list from both lists, and contact those evaluators to determine their willingness to serve. Send the candidate's digital materials to the external evaluators with guidance for the review of the materials.

4.____ Schedule meetings to review the candidate materials in a timely manner.

5.____ Adhere to the committee deadlines in the annual promotion and tenure timeline.

6.____ Read department, school and university *Faculty Promotion and Tenure Policies and Procedures.*

7.____ Review the CV and all support documents in the Candidate Materials section of the Google Drive site. If there are undocumented entries in the CV, work with the candidate to address missing information/documents. The CV is the foundation of the PRC's review.

8.____ Although the candidate determines what activities belong in which area, advise the candidate to reconsider inappropriate choices in order to affect a more favorable balance among the areas of continuing scholarship and professional growth, teaching and service. Advise the candidate to avoid creating a false balance by forcing activities into inappropriate areas.

9.____ Solicit letters and recommendations from professional and faculty colleagues, alumni and students. When sending questionnaires to faculty colleagues, make available the candidate's CV for review. To assure legibility and attribution, request both a printed and signed name on each letter or questionnaire.

10.___ Receive and evaluate the reviews from the external evaluators.

11.___ Schedule an interview between the candidate and the committee, if required or requested. (See department Faculty Promotion and Tenure Policies and Procedures.)

12.___ Prepare subcommittee reports based on each area of review.

13.___ Vote by secret ballot and determine an explicit rating of excellent, very good, satisfactory or unsatisfactory in each of the areas of Continuing Scholarship and Professional Growth, Teaching, and Service. Vote satisfactory or unsatisfactory in the area of Appropriate Credentials. Record the votes and ratings in the minutes, the committee's final report and on the SOTA P&T Cover Sheet of the final report. The votes should support the ratings.

14.___ Vote by secret ballot to recommend for or against promotion and/or tenure. Record the votes and recommendations in the minutes, in the committee's final report and the SOTA P&T Cover Sheet of the final report. The vote should support the recommendation.

15.___ Prepare a final PRC report based on the findings of the sub-committees and the votes of the committee. This is the only documentation of the peer review and assessment that will go forward to the VCU Board of Visitors.

16.___ Upload the report, committee minutes, committee materials to the PRC section of the candidate's Google Drive site by the date specified in the SOTA P&T timeline.

B. <u>General Advice for the Peer Review Committee (PRC)</u>

Prior to charging the PRC, the department chair serves as the primary contact for the candidate, the peer review committee, and the dean. After charging the PRC, the chair of the Peer Review Committee serves as the primary contact for the candidate in communications with the department chair, the SOTA Promotion and Tenure Committee and the dean's office.

1. <u>Chair of Committee</u>
   The chair of the PRC schedules and convenes committee meetings. Once the department chair charges the PRC, the PRC chair serves as the primary liaison of the committee with the candidate, the department chair, and the SOTA Promotion and Tenure Committee chair.
   The chair of the PRC integrates the deadlines in the promotion and tenure timeline into the work of the PRC and adheres to these deadlines.

   Typically, the chair of the PRC communicates with the external evaluators and sends the candidate's review materials to them. (Sometimes the PRC delegates this duty to the committee member who is responsible for reviewing the candidate's materials in the area of continuing scholarship and professional growth). The PRC committee chair discusses responsibilities with committee members and assigns subcommittees to review the candidate's materials.

   If required or requested by the candidate, the PRC chair schedules an interview with the candidate and the committee. The PRC chair should review the department Faculty Promotion and Tenure Policies and Procedures to determine if interviews are required or optional.

   The PRC chair verifies that the candidate's credentials and experience are on file in the dean's office and match the candidate's documentation. The PRC chair verifies any agreements made by the dean or department chair with the candidate at the time of hiring or during the period of probation.

   After receiving and leading discussion of the subcommittee reports, the PRC chair checks the form and content of the sub-committee reports and writes the Peer Review Committee Report. After discussion and revision of the Peer Review Committee Report the PRC chair conducts a secret ballot for each area of the review and for the final vote for or against promotion and/or tenure.

   At the completion of the PRC's review, the PRC uploads the PRC report, the committee minutes, the committee materials, to the PRC section of the Google Drive site by the date specified in the applicable P&T timeline.

2. <u>Secretary</u>
   The PRC secretary records the minutes of the committee meetings and submits the meeting minutes to the committee for review and inclusion in the PRC materials.

3. <u>Documentation</u>
   The PRC fully documents the promotion and tenure review. It verifies verbal communication in writing and provides copies to appropriate individuals or committees. It incorporates materials, letters, memos, minutes etc. into the submission package.

4. <u>External Evaluators</u>
   The PRC directs the external evaluators review of the candidate's accomplishments in the areas of Continuing Scholarship and Professional Growth and Service. It asks potential external evaluators to disclose any personal and/or professional relationships with the candidate. It documents any relationship and the nature of the relationship in the PRC report. The PRC should review university, school and department Faculty Policies and Procedures for Promotion and Tenure for more specific procedures for external evaluators. It should also request a CV or professional biography from each external evaluator.

The candidate prepares digital materials for the external evaluators. The PRC reviews the candidate-prepared external evaluator materials for clarity and completeness and forwards them to the external evaluators with guidance for their review. Electronic signatures are permitted. The PRC chair should note that while the candidate must upload all review materials into the Google Drive site created by the School, digital documents for the external evaluators may reside in any location and be sent in any format the candidate wishes, as long as the documents are readily accessible.

5. <u>Organization of the Peer Review Committee Report</u>
   The PRC should use the following headings and sequence to organize the Peer Review Committee Report (***see also Section D on page 5 for report file naming conventions***):

   1. SOTA P&T Cover Sheet (Google Drive: P&T policies, advice documents and forms)
   2. Introduction
   3. External Evaluators
      External evaluators should be identified by name when introduced in the report, and credentials cited. All subsequent references should refer to the evaluator by a number, e.g. "Evaluator #3 noted that... "
   4. Appropriate Credentials and Experience
   5. Continuing Scholarship and Professional Growth
   6. Teaching
   7. Service
   8. National Recognition (required for promotion to professor)
   9. Summary and Recommendation for or against promotion and/or tenure.

6. <u>Voting, ratings and recommendations, and summary</u>
   All members of the peer review committee vote using a secret ballot for all votes. The chair of the PRC records the votes and the recommendation on the SOTA P&T Cover Sheet (in Google Drive) t and in the final report. In the event of tied or unclear votes, re-voting is appropriate. The PRC records the votes in each area and the final vote. The majority of votes determines the rating or recommendation. Conflicts in voting such as an "unsatisfactory" vote in an area, combined with a vote "for" tenure, are "voting irregularities". Address any voting irregularities and abstentions in the final report.

   Ratings in each area and the recommendation in the summary paragraph must be consistent with department, school, and university *Faculty Promotion and Tenure Policies and Procedures*. The ratings and recommendation must be consistent with the evaluation given in each area. The summary reiterates the requirements for promotion and tenure in the department for the rank under review and states whether or not the candidate meets the requirements. The PRC must support its rating in each area with the documentation and evidence in the report.

   Committee members sign the signature page above their name and rank. The signature page is the final, numbered page of the document. Electronic signatures are permitted.

C. **Submission Materials for Peer Review Committee**

The PRC is responsible for loading all of its documents into the PRC's section of the candidate's Google Drive Site. If applicable, the PRC uploads remaining Candidate documents into the Candidate Materials section of the site.

Materials uploaded by the PRC chair
• Peer Review Committee Report
• Approved minutes of all Peer Review Committee meetings
• External evaluators' signed letters (Electronic signatures are permitted.)
• Each external evaluator's CV or professional biography
• Sample letters and/or evaluation forms sent out to elicit assessment of the candidate (external evaluators, students, university peers, professional associates, alumni and others)
• Responses to the letters and forms
• Student evaluation tabulation forms
• Student evaluations for each semester of teaching
• Candidate's revised CV (if applicable)
• Other relevant review information

D. **Report Naming Convention**

All reports to be submitted in both .docx and .pdf formats.

The naming convention of each report should follow this structure:

- Candidate Last name _ External Evaluator # Letter (.doc or .pdf)
- Candidate Last name _ Peer Review Committee Report (.doc & .pdf)
- Candidate Last name _ Department Chair Letter (.doc & .pdf)
- Candidate Last name _ School of the Arts Committee Report (.doc & .pdf)
- Candidate Last name _ Dean Recommendation (.doc & .pdf)

Screen shots: Main Page, Candidate's Google Drive Site & PRC Page

Drive

Search in Drive

New

- Priority
- My Drive
- Shared drives
- Shared with me
- Recent
- Starred
- Trash

Storage

764.5 GB used

Shared with me > Candidate NAME - Template

Name ↑

1. P&T Policies, Advice Documents & Forms

2. Candidate Materials

3. Peer Review Committee Report and Materials

4. Department Chair/ Director Letter & Cover Sheet

5. School of the Arts P&T Reports & Cover Sheet

6. School of the Arts Dean Letter & Cover Sheet